

**ISO/TC 34/SC 15 N 2202**

ISO/TC 34/SC 15
Coffee

Email of secretary: sherrera@icontec.org
Secretariat: ICONTEC (Colombia)

ISO DIS 18794 Collated Comments

Document type: Other committee document

Date of document: 2017-01-18

Expected action: INFO

Background:

Committee URL: <http://isotc.iso.org/livelink/livelink/open/tc34sc15>

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2016-10-08

Document:

Project: ISO DIS 18794

MB/ NC ¹	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
CO 001	2.1.2			ed	To change unami for umami.	2.1.2 basic taste , noun any one of the distinctive tastes acid/sour, bitter, salty, sweet and umami. [SOURCE: ISO 5492:2008, 3.2]	
CO 002	2.1.8			ed	To change: organs instead to organ, according to 2.1.8 note 1	2.1.8 taste , noun sensations perceived by the taste organs when stimulated by certain soluble substances. Note 1 to entry: The term “taste” should not be used to designate the combination of gustatory, olfactory and trigeminal sensations which are designated by the term “flavour”.	
CO 003	2.1.11			ed	“orthonasal” is an incorrect term. We ask to change: oro-nasal instead to orthonasal.	2.1.11 trigeminal sensation , noun oro-nasal chemestheses , noun sensations resulting from irritation caused by chemical stimuli in the mouth, nose or throat [SOURCE: ISO 5492:2008, 2.19] Note 1 to entry: The stimulation happens when	

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2016-10-08

Document:

Project: ISO DIS 18794

MB/ NC ¹	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
						smelling or drinking the coffee.	
CO 004	2.2.6			te	kaki tannins or sloe tannins are unknown taste in Colombia, we suggest to add some similar cases.	2.2.6 astringency , noun astringent , adj complex sensation, accompanied by shrinking, drawing or puckering of the skin or mucosal surface in the mouth, produced by substances such as kaki tannins or sloe tannins. [SOURCE: ISO 5492:2008, 3.10] Note 1 to entry: Astringency is a mouthfeel suggested to be directly transmitted to the brain through trigeminal nerve endings in the mouth. Note 2 to entry: Produced by substances such as cranberry, spanish lime, green plantain peel or unripe green skin.	
CO 005	2.3.1			te	We suggest to delete the expression "defective and" because the standard should not have any term which qualify any aspect as good or bad.	2.3.1 acrid , adj rough, bitter, astringent, spicy and sharp olfactory and taste sensation. Usually associated to defective and particularly black beans	
CO 006	2.3.2			te	We suggest to delete the expression "is not a fragrant aroma like musk but" because the standard should not have any term which qualify any aspect as good or bad	2.3.2 animal-like , adj	

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2016-10-08

Document:

Project: ISO DIS 18794

MB/ NC ¹	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
						reminiscent of the smell of animals. It is not a fragrant aroma like musk but has the characteristic odour of wet fur, sweat, leather, hides or urine	
CO 007	2.3.3			te	We suggest to delete the expression "and enhances" because the standard should not have any term which qualify any aspect as good or bad	2.3.3 aromatic , adj describes coffee, which fully expresses and enhances the fragrance and aroma inherent to its nature and origin	
CO 008	2.3.5			ed	The idea is to describe the taste, we suggest to add a note that mention how this taste appears in coffee.	2.3.5 baggy , adj agave , noun sack , noun taste associated to natural fiber as jute or fique. Note entry 1: It is derived from coffee packed in poor quality bags or when stored in a manner that the parchment coffee stills is subject to humidity changes for long period of time.	
CO 009	2.3.6			te	The description is poor. We suggest to include some descriptors to explain this taste.	2.3.6 beany pea , adj odour and taste associated to green bean, pea or raw coffee bean due to incomplete or	

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2016-10-08

Document:

Project: ISO DIS 18794

MB/ NC ¹	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
						deficient roasting	
CO 010	2.3.8			ed	To improve the last sentence.	2.3.8 caramel , noun caramelized , adj this odour and taste is produced when sugar is heated without burning it. This is in some roasted coffees	
CO 011	2.3.13			te	We suggest to delete “coffee”, it is not necessary to mention that. We suggest to replace decomposed organic material for carbohydrates that are present in main fermentation.	2.3.13 fermented , adj coffee flavour similar to fermented fruit or carbohydrates. decomposed organic material Produced as a result of the enzymatic over fermentation of some organic compounds.	
CO 012	2.3.21			te	We suggest to delete “coffee” at the first sentence, it is not necessary to mention that. We suggest to add descriptors and a note to mention how this taste appears in coffee.	2.3.21 musty , adj moldy , adj coffee odour and taste related to mold, must, damp closed-air spaces, black soil, damp. Note entry 1. typical of mold developing due to inadequate water content control during different	

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2016-10-08

Document:

Project: ISO DIS 18794

MB/ NC ¹	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
						stages of the process particularly during coffee drying process and storage.	
CO 013	2.3.37			te	We suggest to delete the expression “ in good coffees,” because the standard should not have any term which qualify any aspect as good or bad We suggest to add a note to mention how this taste appears in coffee.	2.3.37 woody, adj flavour descriptor reminiscent of an oak barrel in some cases in good coffees, or dry wood, balsa wood, dead wood. Note 1 to entry one: Similar to dry wood, balsa wood or dead wood in coffees stored with high moisture content for a longer period.	
** 014					Please use the Track Change Word file from ISO/CS as a basis for any further drafting. If you have any questions, you can email me (Nicola) at PEROU@iso.org		
US1 015				Ge	a number of sensory terms are defined in terms of potential cause and effect. This is not correct. The term should be defined only by its sensory characteristic. The use of a potential cause and effect is a common problem when defining sensory terms, but creates problems in the future when the sensory effect is NOT produced by that effect, but something else. The evaluator or the grower/processor often gets confused about the term because s/he knows that that terms can't be right because the cause isn't right. In fact, the term is correct, but was cause by something else. An example is "animal-like". If I describe a coffee as "animal-like" people immediately assume I am talking about a certain type of effect related to "wet dog" or "fur". In fact, this last week I tasted a coffee		

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2016-10-08

Document:

Project: ISO DIS 18794

MB/ NC ¹	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
					that was "animal-like", but tasted more like the "animal like" character that is found in honey (not wet dog", which comes from a completely different cause. Having a definition that specifies a "cause" results in people associated that cause with that attribute, which can be misleading. Thus, all of the "causes" should be removed from the ISO definitions. If they are important they need to go in a different document - perhaps a published review article.		
US2 016				Ge	Sensory terms that are not "sensory descriptors" but surrogates for liking. There are many terms in this list that are surrogates for "liking". not sensory descriptors of coffee. These should be removed. They commonly are used by cuppers, but such terms have been shown to be used inconsistently and are virtually useless as sensory terms (see Di Donfrancesco, B., Gutierrez Guzman, N., Chambers, E. IV. 2014. Comparison of results from cupping and descriptive sensory analysis of Colombian brewed Coffee. J. Sensory Stud. 29: 301-311.). trying to define such terms is virtually impossible because they are not definable in the sense of being able to be used consistently.		
US3 017				Ge	Sensory terms that are already defined elsewhere using better definitions. Terms like insipid are already better defined by TC34/SC12 in their ISO vocabulary. Either that term needs to be adopted and used in this list or simply referred to here. There is no need to redefine it (poorly) in this vocabulary.		
US4 018				Ge	There is a better defined and referenced lexicon that has been published and is not referred to in this document. It is published by World Coffee Research on their website		

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2016-10-08

Document:

Project: ISO DIS 18794

MB/ NC ¹	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
					(https://worldcoffeeresearch.org/work/sensory-lexicon/) and will soon be published in Journal of Sensory Studies (Chambers, E. IV, Sanchez, K., Phan, U.X.T., Miller, R., Cville, G.V., and Di Donfrancesco, B., 2016. Development of a “Living” Lexicon for Descriptive Sensory Analysis of Brewed Coffee. J. Sensory Studies. 31: In Press). That lexicon contains much better definitions and actual references for many of the terms in this vocabulary. It has been adopted by the Specialty Coffee Association of America and by many other Coffee Associations around the world. To ignore that lexicon is not good ISO practice.		
VN 019		02.01	page 1	ed	Add basic some terms of sensory analysis	”Sensory analysis”; “sensory panel”; “scoring”; “Appearance” and “mouthfeel” [from: ISO 5492:2008]	
UK 020		02.01.2		ed		Replace ‘unami’ by ‘umami’.	
UK 021	Note 1	02.01.5		ed		Replace ‘accessed from’ by ‘stimulated by’.	
022	1	02.01.7	1	te	In the definition of sweet taste it’s mentioned: basic taste produce by dilute aqueous solution of natural or artificial substances such as sucrose or aspartame. But the sweet taste that is produced by artificial substances is not a basic taste , basic taste is produced by natural substances.	It’s better to define sweet taste as follows: basic taste produce by dilute aqueous solution of natural substances such as sucrose.	
UK 023		02.01.8		ed		Replace ‘accessed by’ by ‘stimulated by’. Remove comma.	
IN 024	-	02.02 “Generic Terms in the Sensory	-	te	Inclusion of two terminologies relating to monsonned coffee and robusta coffee in the Committee Draft.	To include the following:	

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2016-10-08

Document:

Project: ISO DIS 18794

MB/ NC ¹	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
		Assessment of Coffee".				1. Mellowness: Mellowness is specific to Indian Monsooned Malabar Coffees. The taste arising from the softening of cherry, fruity and harsh characteristics of Natural Coffees (Arabica and Robusta), after completion of the monsooning process. 2. Robusta Taste: Strong and harsh taste specific to Robusta coffee.	
EC 025		02.02.14		te	The metallic taste sensation can be also caused by a deficient drying.	Include a deficient drying as another cause for this taint.	
UK 026		02.02.16		ed		Replace 'for sensorial analysis' by 'in sensory analysis of coffee'.	
UK 027		02.02.3		ed		Replace 'dry aroma coffee' by 'dry coffee aroma'	
UK 028		02.02.4		ed		Replace 'wet aroma coffee' by 'liquid coffee aroma'	
029	2	02.02.4	1	te	In the definition of dry aroma coffee mentioned: odour of roasted and ground coffee before adding water. Because of the normal using of hot water in cup of coffee preparation, it's better to add hot water in	It's better to define the dry aroma odour as follows Odour of roasted and ground coffee before adding hot water.	

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2016-10-08

Document:

Project: ISO DIS 18794

MB/ NC ¹	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
					this statement. Also with using of water, there isn't any meaningful odour for perception.		
UK 030		02.02.7		ed		Replace by 'coffee with an adequate proportion of each characteristic under evaluation and with none of them excessively dominant'.	
UK 031		02.03	General	ed	ISO 5492 defines 'flavour' as the ' <i>complex combination of the olfactory, gustatory and trigeminal sensation perceived during tasting</i> '. It defines 'note' as a ' <i>distinctive and identifiable feature of an odour or a flavour</i> '. It may be desirable to repeat these definitions in this document.	Whether a term refers to a <i>flavour</i> , a <i>note</i> or a <i>taste</i> is for subject experts to decide but the proposals here use 'note' when in doubt since it is more general.	
UK 032		02.03	General	ed	It is desirable to distinguish between an explanation of <i>the meaning</i> of each term and informative suggestions about its possible origins.	Information about possible origins should be conveyed in subsidiary notes.	
UK 033		02.03	General	ed	These definitions are expressed in too many different ways, using phrases such as 'associated with', 'resembling', 'reminiscent of', or 'characteristic of'. While stylistic variety makes most writing more interesting to read, in the case of definitions it creates difficulties for readers, who may seek significance in the different phrases used even where this was not intended.	Choose a systematic way to express all the definitions. Alternative forms should be used only when a real difference in meaning is intended. For example, 'characteristic of X' implies that X is the main or only source of that attribute, whereas 'resembling X' implies only a similarity between the attributes of X and of the product. One set of proposals follows. All use the expression 'resembling' but the expression 'reminiscent of' may be equally good if it is used consistently.	
UK 034		02.03.1		ed		rough, bitter, astringent, spicy and sharp note usually associated with defective and particularly black beans	
UK 035		02.03.10		ed		note resembling chemical compounds such as disinfectants or pesticides Note 1 to entry: 'Medicinal' is most often used in the	

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2016-10-08

Document:

Project: ISO DIS 18794

MB/ NC ¹	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
						case of iodine or phenolic flavours.	
UK 036		02.03.11		ed		note resembling cocoa powder, dark chocolate or milk chocolate Note 1 to entry: This flavour is sometimes described as 'sweet'.	
UK 037		02.03.12		ed		note resembling fresh earth, wet soil or humus Note 1 to entry: This flavour is sometimes caused by mould growth.	
UK 038		02.03.13		ed		note resembling decomposed organic material Note 1 to entry: This flavour is sometimes caused by enzymatic over-fermentation of organic compounds.	
UK 039		02.03.14		ed		note resembling the fragrance of flowers such as honeysuckle, jasmine, dandelion and nettles	
UK 040		02.03.15		ed		note resembling ripe, fresh, citric fruit or coffee cherry	
UK 041		02.03.16		ed		note resembling overripe fruit or coffee pulp	
UK 042		02.03.17		ed		note typical of coffee contaminated with oil derivatives such as fuel oil or gasoline while in processing, transport, storage or roasting	
UK 043		02.03.18		ed		note resembling recently mown grass Note 1 to entry: It may be transitorily present in recently harvested or recently processed coffee or be a result of harvesting unripe coffee	
UK 044		02.03.19		ed		note resembling dry grass or hay Note 1 to entry: It may occur in fresh coffee which has not been conditioned.	

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2016-10-08

Document:

Project: ISO DIS 18794

MB/ NC ¹	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
EC 045		02.03.19		te	Some attributes of taste or odour detected in the coffee can be either a defect or a good characteristic in coffee, depending on its type. This attributes are determined by the evaluator who has the expertise.	Eliminate "it is a feature inherent to some coffee" as it does not add information to the definition and is determine by the evaluator.	
UK 046		02.03.2		ed		note resembling the odour of animals Note 1 to entry: It is not a fragrant odour like musk but resembles wet fur, sweat, leather, hides or urine	
UK 047		02.03.20		ed	The second sentence may be unnecessary.	note resembling fresh weeds or foliage	
UK 048		02.03.21		ed		note resembling mould Note 1 to entry: It may occur in fresh coffee where there was poor control of water content during processing, particularly during coffee drying and storage.	
UK 049		02.03.22		ed		note resembling fresh nuts but not rancid nuts or bitter almonds	
UK 050		02.03.23		ed		note resembling onions Note 1 to entry: It may occur in fresh coffee which has had inadequate fermentation	
UK 051		02.03.24		ed		note resembling Kraft paper or cardboard Note 1 to entry: It may occur in coffee packed or in contact with paper bags or cardboard or in beverages prepared using poor quality or unrinsed paper filters.	
UK 052		02.03.25		ed		note resembling halogen compounds such as creosol, chloride or iodine Note 1 to entry: The term may be used to describe coffees with a flavour such as rio	
UK 053		02.03.26		ed		note resembling aromatic spices such as pepper, oregano or Indian spices	

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2016-10-08

Document:

Project: ISO DIS 18794

MB/ NC ¹	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
EC 054		02.03.26 2.3.33		Te	The terms spicy and piquant are related to spices but are different from each other. The use of terms as aromatic spices in piquant is not clear as it can also be attribute to spicy. The examples proposed also confuse the terms from each other.	The terms should be restructured to avoid confusions and bad interpretations.	
UK 055		02.03.27		ed		note resembling raw potato	
UK 056		02.03.28		ed		note resembling rancid nuts caused by lipid oxidation of roasted or roasted and ground coffee while exposed to air Note 1 to entry: This attribute usually increases with time because of inadequate coffee processing, packing and storage.	
UK 057		02.03.29		ed		fragrance feature typical of freshly roasted coffee Note 1 to entry: This attribute is the most important, intense and outstanding scent of coffee	
UK 058		02.03.3		ed		Replace 'inherent to' by 'characteristic of'.	
UK 059		02.03.30		ed	The proposed definition does not appear to convey any information that is not obvious from the term itself.	Omit	
UK 060		02.03.31		ed		note resembling smoke Note 1 to entry: This attribute usually arises when smoke has contaminated coffee during processing or storage.	
UK 061		02.03.32		ed		flavour different from natural acidity that is excessively sharp, biting and unpleasant Note 1 to entry: This attribute usually arises from excessive fermentation.	

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2016-10-08

Document:

Project: ISO DIS 18794

MB/ NC ¹	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
UK 062		02.03.33		ed		note resembling sweet spices such as cloves, cinnamon and allspice	
UK 063		02.03.34		ed	'Stinker' is a noun so the defined term should probably be 'stinking' or 'putrid'.	strong flavour resembling rotten organic material Note 1 to entry: This attribute usually arises from excessive fermentation of the coffee cherries caused by over-ripeness or faulty processing.	
UK 064		02.03.35		ed		note reminiscent of the flavour of tobacco Note 1 to entry: This term should not be used to describe the flavour of burnt tobacco.	
UK 065		02.03.36		ed		flavour resembling those experienced when drinking wine Note 1 to entry: This term is often used when a strong acidic or fruity note is experienced. Note 2 to entry: Assessors should be cautioned not to apply this term to a sour or fermented coffee flavour.	
UK 066		02.03.37		ed		flavour reminiscent of an oak barrel in good coffees, or of dry wood, balsa wood or dead wood in coffees stored with high moisture content for a long period	
UK 067		02.03.4		ed		having an alkaline taste and an odour resembling the smell of ash	
UK 068		02.03.5		ed		note resembling natural fibre such as jute or fique Note 1 to entry: It may arise from coffee being packed in poor quality bags or stored in such a manner that it is subject to humidity changes for long periods of time.	
UK 069		02.03.6		ed		note resembling raw coffee beans Note 1 to entry: It may arise from incomplete or deficient roasting.	
UK		02.03.7		ed		note characteristic of coffee with very dark roasting.	

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2016-10-08

Document:

Project: ISO DIS 18794

MB/ NC ¹	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
070						Note 1 to entry: It may arise from the roasting process taking too much time. Note 2 to entry: The coffee has a flavour resembling burnt vegetable oil.	
UK 071		02.03.8		ed	The second sentence seems unnecessary.	note produced when sugar is heated to a high temperature without burning it	
UK 072		02.03.9		ed	Too complex and too long.	this descriptor includes notes similar to cereal, malt, toast, freshly baked bread or roasted corn, barley or wheat	
EC 073		02.04	Note 1 to entry	ed	The note applies to the subclause 2.4. According to its position it is understood that it applies only to term 2.4.9.	Place the note to entry after the title of the subclause 2.4.	
UK 074		02.04.1		ed		coffee free from all negative taste attributes and off notes and where all coffee characteristics are easily perceived	
UK 075		02.04.2		ed		describes coffees possessing subtle, sweet and complex flavour notes and without aggressive odours	
UK 076		02.04.3		ed		coffee flavour associated with certain undesirable flavours (such as dust) and heavy to the palate Note 1 to entry: This attribute can be produced at various stages of the process from harvest to cup.	
UK 077		02.04.4		ed		coffee of outstanding delicate and distinctive sensory qualities, clean, mild and aromatic in the cup	
UK 078		02.04.5		ed		unidentified flavour in coffee, often caused by contamination outside the production process	
UK 079		02.04.6		ed		flavour typical of recently harvested coffee or freshly roasted coffee	

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2016-10-08

Document:

Project: ISO DIS 18794

MB/ NC ¹	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
UK 080		02.04.7		ed		lipid mouthfeel in a coffee beverage, not combined with a rancid flavour	
UK 081		02.04.8		ed		Replace 'sensorial' by 'sensory'.	
UK 082		02.04.9		ed		harsh sensation from the coffee Note 1 to entry: It may be caused by defective beans, deficient processing or roasted coffee deterioration. Note 2 to entry: The coffee may also have various flavours such as caramel, chocolate, cocoa, vanilla, peanuts, nuts, almond, malt or spices.	
** 083		03.01.11		ed	orthonasal chemestheses, noun The source document is different.	Changed to match the source document: oro-nasal chemesthesis , noun If it should be different from the source, reject the edit and add a "modified" statement to the source.	
** 084		03.01.5	Note 1 to entry	ed	"The olfactory organ <i>may be accessed</i> from the volatiles of roast coffee or coffee brew..." The meaning of this is not clear: the nose is accessed by the coffee aroma? I find this to be strange wording. Perhaps "The olfactory organ is stimulated by the volatiles..."?	Please revise for clarity.	
** 085		03.02.10	Note 1 to entry	ed	The wording is a little unclear.	Edited for clarity. Please check the edit retains your meaning.	
** 086		03.02.14		ed	It is only allowed to have one sentence for the definition.	The second sentence has been moved into a note to entry (as extra information). Please check this is ok.	

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2016-10-08

Document:

Project: ISO DIS 18794

MB/ NC ¹	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
** 087		03.02.17		ed	Is the second clause of the sentence part of the definition, or is it additional information?	Consider moving the text after the comma to a note 1 to entry.	
** 088		03.02.3 3.2.4		ed	dry aroma coffee (fragrance), noun wet aroma coffee (cup aroma), noun It is not allowed to use brackets to denote alternative terms. Instead, each term shall be on a separate line. ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2 , 16.5.4	Changed to dry aroma coffee, noun dry fragrance, noun wet aroma coffee, noun cup aroma, noun Please check the alternative terms are correct and revise if necessary.	
** 089		03.03		ed	“coffee that fully expresses and enhances the fragrance and aroma inherent to its nature and origin” Is this a valid definition? Can coffee enhance its own fragrance? Also, using aroma to define aromatic is not allowed because it counts as a circular definition.	Please review and revise if needed. An adapted dictionary definition works quite well: “coffee having a pleasant and distinctive smell inherent to its nature and origin”.	
** 090		03.03.1 3.3.26 3.3.27 3.3.28 3.3.35 3.3.36		ed	These terms are listed as adjectives but the word given is not generally used as an adjective: fuel phenol pepper potato stinker tobacco	These may be recognized terms in the industry, in which case there is no problem. But otherwise consider changing them to the adjective form of the word. I have made suggestions on the Word document.	
** 091		03.03.10 3.3.11		ed	chemical medicinal The original definition stated “Medicinal is similar to iodine/phenolic.” which implies that it is has slightly different meaning to “chemical”.	“chemical” and “medicinal” have been separated into two (similar) definitions. Please check this is ok.	

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2016-10-08

Document:

Project: ISO DIS 18794

MB/ NC ¹	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
** 092		03.03.16	Note 1 to entry	ed	The wording is a little unclear.	Edited for clarity. Please check the edit retains your meaning.	
** 093		03.03.18		ed	“feature of coffee contaminated..” The term “feature” is ambiguous. Perhaps this should be an odour, aroma and/or taste?	Consider revising for clarity.	
** 094		03.03.33		ed	“(such as vinegar or acetic acid)” Deleted because “vinegar” cannot be an example of “vinegar”, the term being defined.	Please check this is ok.	
** 095		03.03.35		ed	Is the second clause of the sentence part of the definition, or is it additional information?	Consider moving the text after the comma to a note 1 to entry.	
** 096		03.03.38		ed	“flavour descriptor reminiscent of an oak barrel in good coffees,” What does “good coffees” mean?	Consider adding an explanation as a note 1 to entry.	
** 097		03.03.5 3.3.7 3.3.8 3.3.9 3.3.20 3.3.27 3.3.32 3.3.33		ed	These terms are all descriptors, yet they are listed as nouns: agave sack coal caramel cereal hay straw	Consider whether to use the adjective form instead. I have made suggestions for some of the terms as track changes on the Word document.	

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2016-10-08

Document:

Project: ISO DIS 18794

MB/ NC ¹	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
					pepper smoke sourness vinegar		
** 098		03.04.9	Note 1 to entry	ed	Does this note go with this term? The information does not seem to be particularly specific to "rough".	Please check and revise for clarity.	
EC 099		All document	All document	ge	The terms and definitions of the SCAA are worldwide used and provided certifications to the practitioners.	The terms and definitions should be harmonized with the worldwide used cupping protocols.	
EC 100		All document	All document	te	Where it is applicable, unify the terms odour and smell use as noun in order to homogenize the document.		
MB/NC 1 101	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
UK 102		General		ed	The word 'sensorial' occurs in several places (especially in titles). Although this term can be a synonym for 'sensory' it seems inadvisable to use it in case users imagine that it conveys some unintended distinction.	Replace 'sensorial' by 'sensory' throughout.	
UK 103		General		ed	The expression 'associated to' is used frequently. Although it is understandable, the expression 'associated with' is normally preferred by native speakers of English in these contexts.	Replace 'associated to' by 'associated with' throughout.	
** 104		General		ed	The rules of the 2016 edition of the ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2 have been applied. See comments on the Word document for details.	For information only.	
** 105		General		ed	The rule is that the definition shall be written in such a form that it can replace the term in its context. See ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2 , 16.5.5 All the definitions should be reviewed in light of this	Please review and revise the definitions as needed. I have made some suggestions as track changes on the Word document. You may find it useful to consult ISO 10241-1,	

1 **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2016-10-08	Document:	Project: ISO DIS 18794
-----------------	-----------	------------------------

MB/ NC ¹	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
					rule, especially the following: 3.1.2 basic taste 3.2.7 balanced 3.3.9 cereal et al. 3.4.1 clean	which contains all the rules for terms and definitions, available here (ISO login required) .	

D:\ISO\data\prod_iso_comment-collation\work\temp\ISO_DIS 18794_BIS.doc: Collation successful

D:\ISO\data\prod_iso_comment-collation\work\temp\ISO_DIS 18794_BSI.doc: Collation successful

D:\ISO\data\prod_iso_comment-collation\work\temp\ISO_DIS 18794_ICONTEC.doc: Collation successful

D:\ISO\data\prod_iso_comment-collation\work\temp\ISO_DIS 18794_INEN.doc: Collation successful

D:\ISO\data\prod_iso_comment-collation\work\temp\ISO_DIS 18794_ISIRI.doc: Collation successful

D:\ISO\data\prod_iso_comment-collation\work\temp\ISO_DIS 18794_ISO.doc: Collation successful

D:\ISO\data\prod_iso_comment-collation\work\temp\ISO_DIS 18794_ISO_TC 34_SC 12.doc: Collation successful

D:\ISO\data\prod_iso_comment-collation\work\temp\ISO_DIS 18794_STAMEQ.docx: Collation successful

Collation of files was successful. Number of collated files: 8

SELECTED (number of files): 8

PASSED TEST (number of files): 8

FAILED TEST (number of files): 0

CCT - Version 4.0/2015

¹ **MB** = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

² **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2016-10-08	Document:	Project: ISO DIS 18794
-----------------	-----------	------------------------

MB/ NC ¹	Line number	Clause/ Subclause	Paragraph/ Figure/Table	Type of comment ²	Comments	Proposed change	Observations of the secretariat
------------------------	----------------	----------------------	----------------------------	---------------------------------	----------	-----------------	------------------------------------

1
MB = Member body / **NC** = National Committee (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2
Type of comment: **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial